

U.S. Department of Education

Final Staff Analysis of the Report Submitted by Pakistan

Prepared September 2012

Background

In March 1997, the National Committee on Foreign Medical Education Accreditation (NCFMEA or the Committee) first determined that the accreditation standards used by the Pakistan Medical and Dental Council (the Council or Pakistan) to evaluate medical schools in Pakistan were comparable to those used in the United States. In 2003 and again in 2009, the NCFMEA reaffirmed its prior determination that the standards and processes used by the Council for the evaluation of medical schools remained comparable. The NCFMEA also requested that the Council submit periodic reports describing its continuing accreditation activities.

Summary of Findings

Based on a review of the report submitted by Pakistan, Department staff concludes that the country has provided most of the information requested by the NCFMEA and that its actions since its last review appear to be largely consistent with the NCFMEA Guidelines.

More information is needed related to two areas. The required information is a list of the current accreditation reviews and on-site reviews to medical schools, branch campuses, and clinical clerkship sites, to include core clinical sites.

Staff Analysis

Current status of medical schools

Country Narrative

List of Medical Colleges Currently Operating in Pakistan
(Fully Accredited)

1. Army Medical College,
2. Rawalpindi Medical College,
3. Fatima Jinnah Medical College for Women,
4. King Edward Medical University,

5. Allama Iqbal Medical College,
6. Quaid-e-Azam Medical College,
7. Nishtar Medical College,
8. Services Institute of Medical Sciences,
9. Punjab Medical College,
10. Dow Medical College,
11. Sindh Medical College,
12. Chandka Medical College,
13. Peoples University of Medical & Health Sciences for Women,
14. Khyber Medical College,
15. Ayub Medical College,
16. Bolan Medical College,
17. Liaquat University of Medical & Health Sciences,
18. Karachi Medical & Dental College,
19. Saidu Medical College,
20. Gomal Medical College,
21. Sargodha Medical College,
22. Shaikh Zayed Medical College,
23. Dow International Medical College,
24. Bahria University Medical College,
25. Akhtar Saeed Medical & Dental College,
26. Central Parks Medical College,
27. KUST Institute of Medical Sciences,
28. Jinnah Medical College,
29. Khyber Girls Medical College,
30. Sardar Ghulam Muhammad Maher Medical College,
31. Nawaz Sharif Medical College,
32. Multan Medical & Dental College,
33. Mohiuddin Islamic Medical College,
34. Avicenna Medical College,
35. Shaikh Khalifa Bin Al-Nayhan Medical College,
36. Shalamar Medical & Dental College,
37. Yusra Medical & Dental College,
38. Pak International Medical College,
39. Islamic International Medical College,
40. Lahore Medical & Dental College,
41. FMH College of Medicine & Dentistry,
42. Foundation University Medical College,
43. Shifa College of Medicine,
44. Aga Khan University Medical College,
45. Baqai Medical College,
46. Ziauddin Medical College,
47. Sir Syed College of Medical Sciences for Girls,
48. Hamdard College of Medicine & Dentistry,
49. Jinnah Medical & Dental College,
50. Liaquat College of Medicine & Dentistry,
51. Faculty of Medicine & Allied Medical Sciences/
52. Muhammad Medical College,
53. Kabir Medical College,

54. Frontier Medical College,
55. Women Medical College,
56. Wah Medical College,
57. University Medical College,
58. University College of Medicine & Dentistry,
59. CMH Lahore Medical College,
60. Peshawar Medical College,
61. Islamabad Medical & Dental College,
62. Liaquat National Medical College,
63. Sharif Medical & Dental College,
64. Continental Medical College,
65. Abbottabad International Medical College,
66. Independent Medical College,
67. Rashid Latif Medical College,
68. Islam Medical College,
69. Rehman Medical College,
70. Al-Tibri Medical College,
71. Amna Inayat Medical College,
72. Bacha Khan Medical College,
73. Azra Naheed Medical College,
74. Federal Medical & Dental College,
75. Azad Jammu & Kashmir Medical College,
76. Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Medical College,
77. Khawaja Muhammad Safdar Medical College,
78. Gujranwala Medical College,
79. Sahiwal Medical College,
80. Shaheed Benazir Bhutto Medical College,
81. Bannu Medical College,
82. Quetta Institute of Medical Sciences,
83. Rawal Institute of Health Sciences,
84. Pak Red Crescent Medical & Dental College,
85. Al-Nafees Medical College,
86. Hashmat Medical & Dental College,
87. Aziz Fatimah Medical & Dental College,
88. Ameer-ud-Din/PGMI Medical College,

List attached ANNEXURE-A

Accreditation reviews of School Campuses and Clinical Clerkship Sites After
MARCH, 2009

List attached ANNEXURE-B

Analyst Remarks to Narrative

Pakistan provided a list of the 88 medical schools currently operating in Pakistan. The schools are included on the attached list as fully accredited by the government of Pakistan. Although the Council provided a list of the accreditation reviews of schools and/or clinical clerkships that have occurred since March 2009, Pakistan did not provide the most recent date each of the 88 medical schools currently operating in Pakistan have gone through the accreditation review process.

Staff determination: Additional information is requested for this section. The country needs to provide an updated list of the medical schools currently operating in Pakistan, to include the most recent date each school has gone through the accreditation review process and its accreditation status.

Country Response

document attached as document01.pdf

Analyst Remarks to Response

In response to the draft staff analysis, the country submitted an updated list of the medical schools currently operating in Pakistan, to include the most recent date each school has gone through the accreditation review process and its accreditation status.

Staff Conclusion: Comprehensive response provided

Overview of accreditation activities

Country Narrative

Accreditation reviews of School Campuses and Clinical Clerkship Sites After MARCH, 2009

List attached ANNEXURE-B

Meetings held an accreditation decisions reached. ANNEXURE-C

Accreditation Conference or training sessions held. ANNEXURE-D 1 to 4

Analyst Remarks to Narrative

The Council provided materials (submitted in 22 files titled "Scan Reports") that it states relate to decision meetings, but those materials are not organized in a manner to be appropriately reviewed, do not appear to be current (i.e. since spring of 2009), and do not clearly indicate that meetings were held and that accreditation decisions were reached.

Pakistan also provided a report of one accreditation conference and a list of participants at three training sessions for evaluators (submitted in files titled "Annexure-D1-D4").

The Council provided a list of accreditation reviews and on-site visits (included in Section 1 as "Annexure-B") since March 2009, but the list does not distinguish between accreditation reviews of school campuses and clinical clerkship sites, to include core clinical sites.

Although Pakistan provided materials regarding accreditation reviews, on-site visits, decision meetings, conferences, and training, it did not provide a summary of those key accreditation activities nor limit those materials to the activities that have occurred since the spring of 2009. In particular, Pakistan provided no narrative to summarize and clarify the many attachments submitted in this section. It is not reasonable to expect Department staff and the NCFMEA to cull through voluminous documents to ferret out relevant information.

Staff determination: Additional information is requested for this section. The country needs to provide a summary of the key accreditation activities that have occurred since spring of 2009. It must also provide clearly organized and current documentation to support the activity summary.

Country Response

Document 02

Overview of accreditation activities

Additional information required summary of key accreditation activities since March, 2009 alongwith supporting documents including

- accreditation reviews of school campuses and clinical clerkship sites, dates of on-site visits of all core clinical sites
- meetings held of accreditation boards and decisions reached.
- Attached as annexures with legend as document 2 (contd)

Note As mentioned in our submitted law and regulations made theirunder, the Council acts primarily as a regulatory body for the universities. The Council has the powers to randomly inspection the examination of any university at any of its affiliated or constituent medical college. The council inspects the examinations of the universities held at various accredited colleges as per schedules issued by the universities. While examinations are being evaluated all ancillary teaching training facilities are inspected.

After March, 2009, other than onsite visits for first time accreditation of new medical colleges, the previously recognized medical colleges with the specific remarks "Random Check, were inspected during the university examinations and all ancillary teaching and training facilities were evaluated at that time and reports were submitted before the Executive Committee and the Council which are the accreditation approving bodies.

We are conscious that the volume of documentation is rather huge, but it is submitted that this is the way things are done in the Council and we do go in

minute details to ensure fulfillment of the standards of the Council. Everything was sent to you so that you may randomly select an example and appreciate the due processes of the Council and see how thoroughly the facilities of the institutions and the standard of the examination are inspected and how meticulously they are evaluated by the Executive Committee and the Council. So now all the accreditation activities detail are being resubmitted college wise for your convenience. Each college detail contains the site inspection report, analysis by the Executive Committee and approval by the Council. Activities/clerkship and list of participants at three training sessions for evaluators already (submitted in files titled Annexure-D1-D4)

Analyst Remarks to Response

In response to the draft staff analysis, the Council provided a list of all the accreditation reviews since March 2009 (submitted as "contd 2.pdf") and supporting documents (submitted in 327 files titled "overview of accreditation activities"). The voluminous materials include the on-site review documentation and executive committee and council decision meeting documentation for each institution listed. The list provides the key to link the materials to the appropriate institution.

Although Pakistan provided a list of the accreditation reviews and supporting on-site review materials for the "random check" reviews described in the narrative, there is no distinguishing between accreditation reviews of school campuses and clinical clerkship sites, to include core clinical sites.

Pakistan also stated that the previously submitted report for the one accreditation conference and a list of participants at three training sessions for evaluators (submitted in files titled "Annexure-D1-D4") are the only conferences and/or training to have occurred since March 2009.

Staff determination: Additional information is requested for this section. The country needs to distinguish between accreditation reviews of school campuses and clinical clerkship sites, to include core clinical sites, as requested in this section.

Staff Conclusion: Additional Information requested

Laws and regulations

Country Narrative

Since March 2009 there is no substantial change in the accreditation standards of the Council, but they have been legally worded and published in the official gazette as a statutory notification and this has greatly enhanced its legal value. All statutory notification in Pakistan are enforceable through the high courts as per constitution of Pakistan and any deviation from statutory notification can be

met with penal consequences. Attached are

1. Accreditation standard of PM&DC title as the Medical and Dental Institutions (recognition, eligibility criteria for enhancement in annual admissions and accreditation standards) Regulations, ANNEXURE-E.
2. Pakistan Medical & Dental Council Regulations for the Appointment of Faculty Professorial Staff/Examiners/Principals/Deans/Administrative Staff in Undergraduate & Postgraduate Medical & Dental Institutions of Pakistan. ANNEXURE-F
3. The Medical and Dental Council Regulations. Part-X The Appointment powers, Duties and Procedure of Inspectors. ANNEXURE-G

Analyst Remarks to Narrative

Pakistan states that there have been no changes to its laws affecting the accreditation of its medical schools. However, the standards have been strengthened by virtue of their publication as a “statutory notification”, which makes them enforceable through the courts. Pakistan provided copies of regulations that authorize the Council (Annexure-G) and direct medical school operations, to include faculty and staff appointments (Annexure-F).

Standards

Country Narrative

Since March 2009 there is no substantial change in the accreditation standards of the Council governing all the above aspects, but the standards have been legally worded and published in the official gazette as a statutory notification and this has greatly enhanced its legal value. All statutory notification in Pakistan are enforceable through the high courts as per constitution of Pakistan and any deviation from statutory notification can be met with penal consequences. Accreditation criteria is already attached as ANNEXURE-E in question 3.

Analyst Remarks to Narrative

Pakistan states that there have been no changes to its accreditation standards since 2009, although the medical school regulations were officially published in January 2012. A copy of the medical school regulations was provided as documentation.

Processes and procedures

Country Narrative

These aspects are governed by the accreditation standards ANNEXURE-E.

The Medical and Dental Council Regulations. Part-X The Appointment powers, Duties and Procedure of Inspectors. ANNEXURE-G

Analyst Remarks to Narrative

As stated and documented in the previous sections, there have been no changes to the Council's accreditation processes and procedures.

Schedule of upcoming accreditation activities

Country Narrative

Upcoming accreditation meetings and onsite visits to medical schools and clinical clerkship sites. ANNEXURE-H

Analyst Remarks to Narrative

Pakistan stated that it provided a list of upcoming accreditation meetings and on-site visits to medical schools and clinical clerkships. However, the list provided includes all 88 medical schools currently accredited by the Council and is titled "ALL NEEDING 2ND INSPECTION" with no additional information to clarify the classification, nor any indication as to when those on-site visits are scheduled to occur.

In addition, Pakistan provided no information regarding upcoming accreditation meetings. The Council needs to provide information on its upcoming accreditation meetings, or indicate that it does not have any currently scheduled.

Staff determination: Additional information is requested for this section. The country needs to provide an updated list of the on-site visits scheduled to medical schools, branch campuses, and clinical clerkship sites, to include the date of such visits. Pakistan needs to also provide information on its upcoming accreditation meetings, or indicate that it does not have any currently scheduled.

Country Response

document attached as document03.pdf

Analyst Remarks to Response

In response to the draft staff analysis, Pakistan provided a document titled "Schedule of upcoming accreditation activities," with no narrative to clarify the document. The document include a list of 66 institutions, as well as the date of inspection, for accreditation visits and clinical training sites. However, the document does not distinguish between on-site visits scheduled to medical schools, branch campuses, and clinical clerkship sites.

The document also states that upcoming accreditation meetings will occur in November 2012 and November 2013.

Staff determination: Additional information is requested for this section. The country needs to provide an updated list of the on-site visits scheduled to distinguish between evaluations to medical schools, branch campuses, and clinical clerkship sites, as requested in this section.

Staff Conclusion: Additional Information requested
